ELECTRONIC FILING, RECEIVED, CLERK'S OFFICE, NOVEMBER 14, 2005

BEFORE THE ILLINOIS POLLUTION CONTROL BOARD

PEOPLE OF THE STATE OF ILLINOIS,

ex rel. LISA MADIGAN, Attorney

General of the State of Illinois,

Complainant,

v.

v.

PCB 05-103

(Enforcement-Air)

MARC REALTY, INC., an Illinois

corporation, 55 E. JACKSON, LLC,

an Illinois Limited Liability

Company,

Respondents.

NOTICE OF FILING

TO: William Seith
631 E. Butterfield Road
Suite 315
Lombard, IL 60148

PLEASE TAKE NOTICE that I have today filed electronically with the Office of the Clerk of the Pollution Control Board the Stipulation and Proposal for Settlement with Respondents Marc Realty, Inc. and 55 E. Jackson, LLC, and Motion for Relief from Hearing Requirement a copy of which is herewith served upon you.

_Christopher P. Re

Dated: November 14, 2005

Office of the Attorney General Environmental Bureau 188 W. Randolph Street, 20th Floor Chicago, Illinois 60601 312 814-3532

BEFORE THE ILLINOIS POLLUTION CONTROL BOARD

PEOPLE OF THE STATE OF ILLINOIS, ex rel. LISA MADIGAN, Attorney General of the State of Illinois,)))
Complainant,)
v.) PCB 05-103) (Enforcement-Air
MARC REALTY, INC., an Illinois corporation, 55 E. JACKSON, LLC, an Illinois Limited Liability Company,)
Respondents.)

MOTION TO REQUEST RELIEF FROM HEARING REQUIREMENT

NOW COMES the Complainant, PEOPLE OF THE STATE OF ILLINOIS, by LISA MADIGAN, Attorney General of the State of Illinois, and requests relief from the hearing requirement in the above-captioned matter. In support thereof, the Complainant states as follows:

- 1: On November 30, 2004, a Complaint was filed with the Pollution Control Board ("Board") in this matter. Simultaneously with this Motion, the Complainant and Respondents Marc Realty, Inc. and 55 East Jackson, LLC are filing a Stipulation and Proposal for Settlement with the Board.
- 2. Section 31(c)(2) of the Illinois Environmental Protection Act ("Act"), 415 ILCS 5/31(c)(2),(2002) allows the parties in certain enforcement cases to request relief from the mandatory hearing requirement where the parties have submitted to the Board a stipulation and proposal for settlement. Section 31(c)(2) provides:

Notwithstanding the provisions of subdivision (1) of this subsection (c), whenever a complaint has been filed on behalf of the Agency or by the People of the State of Illinois, the parties may file with the Board

a stipulation and proposal for settlement accompanied by a request for relief from the requirement of a hearing pursuant subdivision (1). Unless the Board, in its discretion, concludes that a hearing will be held, the Board shall cause notice of the stipulation, proposal and request for relief to be published and sent in the same manner as is required for hearing pursuant to subdivision (1) of this subsection. notice shall include a statement that any person may file a written demand for hearing within 21 days after receiving the notice. If any person files a timely written demand for hearing, the Board shall deny the request for relief from a hearing and shall hold a hearing in accordance with the provisions of subdivision (1).

- 3. No hearing is currently scheduled in the instant case.
- 4. The Complainant requests the relief conferred by Section 31(c)(2) of the Act.

WHEREFORE, the Complainant, PEOPLE OF THE STATE OF ILLINOIS, by LISA MADIGAN, Attorney General of the State of Illinois, requests relief from the requirement of a hearing pursuant to 415 ILCS 5/31(c)(2)(2002).

ELECTRONIC FILING, RECEIVED, CLERK'S OFFICE, NOVEMBER 14, 2005

Respectfully submitted,

PEOPLE OF THE STATE OF ILLINOIS,

LISA MADIGAN,

Attorney General of the

State of Illinois

Christopher P Perza

Assistant Artorney General

Office of the Attorney General Environmental Bureau 188 West Randolph Street, 20th Fl. Chicago, IL 60601 312/814-3532

BEFORE THE ILLINOIS POLLUTION CONTROL BOARD

PEOPLE OF THE STATE OF ILLINOIS,
by LISA MADIGAN, Attorney General
of the State of Illinois,

Complainant,

v.

PCB 05-103
(Enforcement-Air)

MARC REALTY, INC., an Illinois
corporation, 55 E. JACKSON LLC,
a Delaware Limited Liability
Company,

Respondents.

STIPULATION AND PROPOSAL FOR SETTLEMENT

Complainant, PEOPLE OF THE STATE OF ILLINOIS, by LISA
MADIGAN, Attorney General of the State of Illinois, the Illinois
Environmental Protection Agency ("Illinois EPA"), MARC REALTY,
INC. and 55 E. JACKSON LLC ("Respondents"), have agreed to the
making of this Stipulation and Proposal for Settlement
("Stipulation") and submit it to the Illinois Pollution Control
Board ("Board") for approval. The parties agree that the
statement of facts contained herein represents a fair summary of
the evidence and testimony which would be introduced by the
parties if a hearing were held. The parties further stipulate
that this statement of facts is made and agreed upon for purposes
of settlement only and that neither the fact that a party has
entered into this Stipulation, nor any of the facts stipulated

herein, shall be introduced into evidence in any other proceeding regarding the claims asserted in the Complaint except as otherwise provided herein. If the Board approves and enters this Stipulation, Respondent agrees to be bound by the Stipulation and Board Order and not to contest their validity in any subsequent proceeding to implement or enforce their terms.

I. JURISDICTION

The Board has jurisdiction of the subject matter herein and of the parties consenting hereto pursuant to the Illinois Environmental Protection Act ("Act"), 415 ILCS 5/1 et seq. (2002).

II. AUTHORIZATION

The undersigned representatives for each party certify that they are fully authorized by the party whom they represent to enter into the terms and conditions of this Stipulation and to legally bind them to it.

III. STATEMENT OF FACTS

A. Parties

1. On November 30, 2004, a Complaint was filed on behalf of the People of the State of Illinois by Lisa Madigan, Attorney General of the State of Illinois, on her own motion and upon the

request of the Illinois EPA, pursuant to Section 31 of the Act, 415 ILCS 5/31(2002), against the Respondent.

- 2. The Illinois EPA is an administrative agency of the State of Illinois, created pursuant to Section 4 of the Act, 415 ILCS 5/4 (2002).
- 3. At all times relevant to the Complaint, Respondent Marc Realty, Inc. was and is an Illinois corporation that is authorized to transact business in the State of Illinois.

 Respondent 55 EAST JACKSON, L.L.C., was and is an Illinois limited liability company in good standing.

B. Site Description

1. Respondent MARC REALTY, INC., at all times relevant to the Complaint in this matter, has operated and managed an office building located at 55 East Jackson Street, Chicago, Cook County, Illinois ("facility"). Respondent 55 EAST JACKSON, L.L.C., owned the facility.

١

C. Allegations of Non-Compliance

Complainant contends that the Respondent has violated the following provisions of the Act and Board regulations:

Count I: Air pollution, in violation of Section 9(a) of the Act, 415 ILCS 5/9(a) (2002).

Count II: Failure to comply with National Emissions
Standards for Hazardous Air Pollutants, in
violation of Section 9.1(d) of the Act, 415 ILCS
5/9.1(d) (2002), and 40 C.F.R. § 61.145(c)(1) &
(6)(2002); and, 40 C.F.R. § 61.150(b) (2002).

D. Admission of Violations

The Respondent represents that it has entered into this Stipulation for the purpose of settling and compromising disputed claims without having to incur the expense of contested litigation. By entering into this Stipulation and complying with its terms, the Respondent does not affirmatively admit the allegations of violation within the Complaint and referenced within Section III.C herein, and this Stipulation shall not be interpreted as including such admission.

E. Compliance Activities to Date

Respondent took steps necessary to achieve compliance shortly after their observation.

IV. APPLICABILITY

This Stipulation shall apply to and be binding upon the Complainant and the Respondent, and any officer, director, agent, or employee of the Respondent, as well as any successors or assigns of the Respondent. The Respondent shall not raise as a defense to any enforcement action taken pursuant to this Stipulation the failure of any of its officers, directors,

agents, employees or successors or assigns to take such action as shall be required to comply with the provisions of this .

Stipulation.

V. COMPLIANCE WITH OTHER LAWS AND REGULATIONS

This Stipulation in no way affects the responsibilities of the Respondent to comply with any other federal, state or local laws or regulations including, but not limited to, the Act and the Board regulations, 35 Ill. Adm. Code, Subtitles A through H.

VI. IMPACT ON THE PUBLIC RESULTING FROM ALLEGED NON-COMPLIANCE

Section 33(c) of the Act, 415 ILCS 5/33(c)(2002), provides as follows:

In making its orders and determinations, the Board shall take into consideration all the facts and circumstances bearing upon the reasonableness of the emissions, discharges, or deposits involved including, but not limited to:

- the character and degree of injury to, or interference with the protection of the health, general welfare and physical property of the people;
- 2. the social and economic value of the pollution source;
- 3. the suitability or unsuitability of the pollution source to the area in which it is located, including the question of priority of location in the area involved;
- 4. the technical practicability and economic reasonableness of reducing or eliminating the

emissions, discharges or deposits resulting from such pollution source; and

5. any subsequent compliance.

In response to these factors, the parties state the following:

- 1. The impact to the public resulting from Respondents' noncompliance was that mismanagement of asbestos can result in the public being exposed to levels of airborne asbestos that may threaten human health.
- 2. The facility that is the subject of the Complaint has social and economic value.
- 3. The facility that is the subject of the Complaint is suitable to the area in which it is located.
- 4. Complying with the requirements of the Act and the Board Regulations is both technically practicable and economically reasonable.
- 5. Respondent achieved compliance by abating and encapsulating the asbestos prior to recommencing renovation activities.

VII. CONSIDERATION OF SECTION 42(h) FACTORS

Section 42(h) of the Act, 415 ILCS 5/42(h)(2002), provides as follows:

In determining the appropriate civil penalty to be imposed under . . . this Section, the Board is authorized to consider any matters of record in mitigation or aggravation of penalty, including but not limited to the following factors:

- 1. the duration and gravity of the violation;
- 2. the presence or absence of due diligence on the part of the respondent in attempting to comply with requirements of this Act and regulations thereunder or to secure relief therefrom as provided by this Act;
- 3. any economic benefits accrued by the respondent because of delay in compliance with requirements, in which case the economic benefits shall be determined by the lowest cost alternative for achieving compliance;
- 4. the amount of monetary penalty which will serve to deter further violations by the respondent and to otherwise aid in enhancing voluntary compliance with this Act by the respondent and other persons similarly subject to the Act;
- 5. the number, proximity in time, and gravity of previously adjudicated violations of this Act by the respondent;
- 6. whether the respondent voluntarily self-disclosed, in accordance with subsection i of this Section, the non-compliance to the Agency; and
- 7. whether the respondent has agreed to undertake a "supplemental environmental project," which means an environmentally beneficial project that a respondent agrees to undertake in settlement of an enforcement action brought under this Act, but which the respondent is not otherwise legally required to perform.

In response to these factors, the parties state as follows:

1. The Complainant alleges that the Respondent failed to comply with the asbestos NESHAP regulations and provisions of the Act and Board rules as alleged in the Complaint. The violations were observed on July 25, 2003 and resolved that day.

- 2. Respondent was diligent in attempting to come back into compliance with the Act, Board regulations and applicable federal regulations, once the Illinois EPA notified it of its noncompliance.
- 3. The penalty obtained negates any economic benefit accrued as a result of the violations.
- 4. Complainant has determined, based upon the specific facts of this matter, that a penalty of Fifteen Thousand Dollars (\$15,000.00) will serve to deter further violations and aid in future voluntary compliance with the Act and Board regulations.
- 5. Prior alleged violations were the subject of a previous Board case, and an accepted stipulation and proposal for settlement (People of the State of Illinois v. Marc Realty, Inc., 11 East Adams St., LLC and Roberts Environmental Control, Inc., PCB 04-100).
 - 6. Self-disclosure is not at issue in this matter.
- 7. The settlement of this matter does not include a supplemental environmental project.

VIII. TERMS OF SETTLEMENT

A. Penalty Payment

1. The Respondent shall pay a civil penalty in the sum of Fifteen Thousand Dollars (\$15,000.00) within thirty (30) days from the date the Board adopts and accepts this Stipulation. The

Respondent stipulates that payment has been tendered to Respondent's attorney of record in this matter in a form acceptable to that attorney. Further, Respondent stipulates that said attorney has been directed to make the penalty payment on behalf of Respondent, within thirty (30) days from the date the Board adopts and accepts this Stipulation, in a manner prescribed below. The penalty described in this Stipulation shall be paid by certified check, money order or electronic funds transfer payable to the Illinois EPA, designated to the Illinois Environmental Protection Trust Fund and submitted to:

Illinois Environmental Protection Agency Fiscal Services Section 1021 North Grand Avenue East P.O. Box 19276 Springfield, IL 62794-9276

The name and number of the case and Respondent's Federal Employer Identification Number (FEIN) shall appear on the check. A copy of the certified check, money order or record of electronic funds transfer and any transmittal letter shall be sent to:

Christopher P. Perzan Assistant Attorney General Environmental Bureau 188 W. Randolph St., 20th Floor Chicago, Illinois 60601

2. Pursuant to Section 42(g) of the Act, 415 ILCS 5/42(g) (2002), interest shall accrue on any payment not paid within the time period prescribed above at the maximum rate allowable under

Section 1003(a) of the Illinois Income Tax Act, 35 ILCS 5/1003 (2002). Interest on any unpaid payment shall begin to accrue from the date the payment is due and continue to accrue until the date payment is received. When partial payment(s) are made, such partial payment shall be first applied to any interest on unpaid payment then due and owing. All interest on payment owed shall be paid by certified check, money order or electronic funds transfer, payable to the Illinois EPA, designated to the Illinois Environmental Protection Trust Fund and delivered to the address and in the manner described above.

3. For purposes of payment and collection, Respondent may be reached at the following address:

Gerald Lee Nudo

Marc Realty LLC

55 E. Jackson Street

Suite 500

Chicago, IL 60604

4. In the event of default of this Section VIII.A, the Complainant shall be entitled to all available relief including, but not limited to, reasonable costs of collection and reasonable attorney's fees.

D. Future Use

Notwithstanding any other language in this Stipulation to the contrary, and in consideration of the mutual promises and

conditions contained in this Stipulation, including the Release from Liability contained in Section VIII.F, below, the Respondent hereby agrees that this Stipulation may be used against the Respondent in any subsequent enforcement action or permit proceeding as proof of a past adjudication of violation of the Act and the Board Regulations promulgated thereunder for all violations alleged in the Complaint in this matter, for purposes of Section 39(a) and (i) and/or 42(h) of the Act, 415 ILCS 5/39(a) and(i) and/or 5/42(h) (2002). Further, Respondent agrees to waive any rights to contest, in any subsequent enforcement action or permit proceeding, any allegations that these alleged violations were adjudicated.

E. Cease and Desist

The Respondent shall cease and desist from future violations of the Act and Board Regulations that were the subject matter of the Complaint as outlined in Section III.C ("Allegations of Non-Compliance") of this Stipulation.

F. Release from Liability

In consideration of the Respondent's payment of the \$15,000.00 penalty, to Cease and Desist as contained in Section VIII.E and upon the Pollution Control Board's acceptance and approval of the terms of this Stipulation and Proposal for

Settlement, the Complainant releases, waives and discharges the Respondent from any further liability or penalties for violations of the Act and Board Regulations that were the subject matter of the Complaint herein. The release set forth above does not extend to any matters other than those expressly specified in Complainant's Complaint filed on November 30, 2004. The Complainant reserves, and this Stipulation is without prejudice to, all rights of the State of Illinois against the Respondent with respect to all other matters, including but not limited to, the following:

- a. criminal liability;
- b. liability for future violation of state, federal,
 local, and common laws and/or regulations;
- c. liability for natural resources damage arising out of the alleged violations; and
- d. liability or claims based on the Respondent's failure to satisfy the requirements of this Stipulation.

Nothing in this Stipulation is intended as a waiver, discharge, release, or covenant not to sue for any claim or cause of action, administrative or judicial, civil or criminal, past or future, in law or in equity, which the State of Illinois or the Illinois EPA may have against any person, as defined by Section 3.315 of the Act, 415 ILCS 5/3.315, or entity other than the Respondent.

G. Right of Entry

In addition to any other authority, the Illinois EPA, its employees and representatives, and the Attorney General, her agents and representatives, shall have the right of entry into and upon the Respondent's facility which is the subject of this Stipulation, at all reasonable times for the purposes of carrying out inspections. In conducting such inspections, the Illinois EPA, its employees and representatives, and the Attorney General, her employees and representatives may take photographs, samples, and collect information, as they deem necessary.

J. Enforcement of Board Order

- 1. Upon the entry of the Board's Order approving and accepting this Stipulation and Proposal for Settlement, that Order is a binding and enforceable order of the Illinois Pollution Control Board and may be enforced as such through any and all available means.
- 2. Respondent agrees that notice of any subsequent proceeding to enforce the Board Order approving and accepting this Stipulation and Proposal for Settlement may be made by mail and waives any requirement of service of process.

- 3. The parties agree that, if the Board does not approve and accept this Stipulation and Proposal for Settlement, then neither party is bound by the terms herein.
- 4. It is the intent of the Complainant and Respondent that the provisions of this Stipulation and Proposal for Settlement and any Board Order accepting and approving such shall be severable, and should any provision be declared by a court of competent jurisdiction to be inconsistent with state or federal law, and therefore unenforceable, the remaining clauses shall remain in full force and effect.

WHEREFORE, Complainant and Respondent request that the Board adopt and accept the foregoing Stipulation and Proposal for Settlement as written.

PEOPLE OF THE STATE OF ILLINOIS,

LISA MADIGAN Attorney General State of Illinois

MATTHEW J. DUNN, Chief Environmental Enforcement/ Asbestos Litigation Division

BY:

Environmental Bureau Assistant Attorney General

ILLINOIS ENVIRONMENTAL PROTECTION AGENCY

BY:

ROBERT A. MESSINA Chief Legal Counsel

MARC REALTY, INC. 55 EAST JACKSON, LLC

BY:

Name: GENALD LES Nudo

Title: MANAGER

DATE: Movember 1, 2005-

ELECTRONIC FILING, RECEIVED, CLERK'S OFFICE, NOVEMBER 14, 2005

CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE

I, the undersigned, certify that I have served the attached Stipulation and Proposal for Settlement with Respondents Marc Realty, Inc. and 55 E. Jackson, LLC, and Motion for Relief from Hearing Requirement, by depositing the same in the United States Mail, postage fully prepaid, upon the following persons:

William Seith 631 E. Butterfield Road Suite 315 Lombard, IL 60148

Christopher P. Perzar

Dated: November 14, 2005